



Benguet State University-Buguias Campus in 17 Years (1998-2015): Graduate Employability and Student Satisfaction

Jayne B. Miranda*, Martha C. Lagadan, Rio Ann B. Arceo, Samuel P. Reyes, and Julius B. Dominguez

Benguet State University-Buguias Campus

*Corresponding author email address: jaynemiranda56@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Date Received: 06-07-2021

Date Last Revised: 02-02-2022

Date Accepted: 03-25-2022

KEYWORDS

BSU-Buguias Campus
Graduate Employability
Tracer Study
Employer Satisfaction
Student Satisfaction

Abstract

This paper presents the employment status, factors associated with the unemployment of graduates, employment performance of graduates from the employer, and satisfaction level of graduates. Out of 498 graduates from 1998 to 2015, 236 were traced using a qualitative survey-based design. Results showed that 38.14% were employed in public and private schools, 50.84% were underemployed, and 11.02% were unemployed. The underemployment and unemployment were associated with family concern, lack of job opportunity, lack of work experience, and lack of professional eligibility. The majority of unemployed graduates were females who married early and took care of the family, thus, prioritizing familial obligation over employment. Employers were very satisfied with the job knowledge, attendance, punctuality, diligence, and work ethics of the BSU-Buguias campus graduates. For the student satisfaction based on the educational training criteria, the overall mean is 3.49, described as very highly satisfied. The perceived extent to which competencies contributed to the development of graduates had an overall mean of 3.31, also described as very high. The study recommends aligning offered programs to changing job demands, conducting in-house reviews for the licensure examination, and evaluating program offerings to strengthen their quality and improve outcomes for students.

Introduction

Graduate employability is one of the major concerns of any university since it contributes to the school's reputation and ranking, which further encourages students' admission and retention. Graduate employability has been emphasized as universities cater to the growing importance of graduate outcomes.

Employment contributes to the economic

growth of a country. Building human capital is then needed, and it is based on the investment in employee skills and knowledge through education. The concept of human capital recognizes that not all labor is equal. Employers can improve the quality of that capital by investing in employees' education, experience, and abilities, which all have economic value for employers and the economy (Kenton, 2020). Since human capital is based on employees' skills and knowledge through education, educational institutions have their share in

increasing the employability of their graduates, considering that employability is associated with higher education quality.

Employability is a set of achievements – skills, understandings, and personal attributes that makes graduates more likely to gain employment and be successful in their chosen occupations, which benefits themselves, the workforce, the community, and the economy (Kempster, 2021). Also, employability is not just about getting a job but rather pertains to the set of skills and attributes that will enable graduates to be successful throughout their working life. Skills learned in school provide economic value because a knowledgeable workforce can lead to increased productivity.

Furthermore, employment is an important part of people's lives because it means more than just the monetary aspect of life, but also making choices about how one wants to live. Thus, getting employed is the dream of everyone much more if a person has finished a degree.

The employment rate worldwide is decreasing. According to the United Nation Statistics Division (UNSD) 2020, the global unemployment rate reached 6.5 percent, higher by 1.1 percent from the previous year (2019). The number of people unemployed worldwide increased by 33 million, reaching 220 million. In the Philippines, about 41.3 million Filipinos were employed in July 2020 and 42.5 million in July 2019 (Philippine Statistics Authority [PSA], 2020), implying that the employment rate also dropped.

Rada (2019) showed that 20.9 percent of the unemployed were college graduates. This result should not be neglected, as Picardo (2020) noted that when workers are unemployed, their families lose wages, and the nation as a whole loses its contribution to the economy in terms of the goods or services that could have been produced. Unemployed workers also lose their purchasing power, leading to unemployment for other workers, creating a cascading effect that ripples through the economy. In this way, unemployment can impact even those still employed. Therefore, universities need to study the employability of their graduates.

On the other hand, the concept of students' satisfaction with the range of services offered by HEIs has gained momentum in recent years in

the quest for quality of higher education (Alhasan et al., 2018). It is necessary to assess client satisfaction, expectations, and preferences on the overall environment of the institution to make the institution progressive and effective. Improving service quality enhances customer satisfaction and makes them loyal (Aftab et al., 2016). Also, according to Malik et al. (2010), the quality of service in educational institutions is an important factor to be considered to attract and retain students and other stakeholders or customers in general. Improving service quality helps in achieving excellence at the higher education level. Any institution can achieve success only by understanding and fulfilling client needs.

There are two major types of satisfaction: customer satisfaction (consumer satisfaction) and job satisfaction (employee satisfaction). Others are social satisfaction, economic satisfaction, citizen and life satisfaction. This paper only deals with customer satisfaction as it only assesses graduates' satisfaction level regarding educational training, creativity, critical thinking and problem-solving skills, delivery of content, and teaching methods. It also ascertains the extent to which the various competencies contributed to the development of graduates concerning: communication and collaboration skills; creativity, critical thinking, and problem-solving skills; entrepreneurial skills, information technology, leadership, life and career skills; and productivity and accountability skills.

Despite the lack of consensus over the concept of quality, service quality has become one of the central components of reform and policy instruments to adapt in higher education institutions to the increasing expectation from internal and external stakeholders worldwide (Kahsay, 2012). Ramya et al. (2019) define service quality as assessing how well a delivered service conforms to the client's expectations. Service business operators often assess the service quality provided to their customers to improve their service, quickly identify problems, and better assess client satisfaction. Perceived service quality is a forerunner to satisfaction. In this case, the graduates' satisfaction and feedback are used as one indicator of service quality.

Gallemand (2020) stated that the economic impact of customer dissatisfaction is considerable as it generates both direct and indirect costs. Measuring customer satisfaction enables companies like schools to identify factors of dissatisfaction.



By doing so, they can implement the necessary improvement of services. The relationship between satisfaction and retention is more complex than it appears. Nonetheless, a satisfied customer like a graduate is more likely to remain loyal to the brand or the institution if expectations are met.

Dissatisfied customers tend to share their bad experiences in their everyday conversations, including those on social media. Like in schools, getting feedback from graduates as they leave the institution is needed. By remaining vigilant about graduate satisfaction, the institution may improve its facilities and programs to ensure clients a quality program and service. The dissatisfaction of graduates may have different causes like the quality of the product or service, a flawed teacher-student relationship, and the like. A complete panorama of the principal areas for improvement will be revealed by measuring different elements. This panorama will enable the schools to improve their offering and propose a product or curriculum to satisfy their students better.

The students are the most important asset for any educational institution. Benguet State University-Buguias Campus or any other higher education institution considers the satisfaction of their graduates regarding their educational training, facilities, and services offered in the institution.

Furthermore, gathering and disseminating results of perceptions and satisfaction will enable the school to review and make appropriate adjustments in its curricular offerings or policies when the student data indicates that change or improvement is needed. Also, listening to student comments and concerns allows for pedagogical progress.

Finally, regularly measuring customer satisfaction also serves to evaluate the impact of the school's efforts to improve customer satisfaction. If satisfaction increases, it is clear that the school is moving in the right direction.

Given the above discussion on the importance of graduate employability and student satisfaction, this research aimed to a) assess the employability of the graduates of BSU-Buguias campus from 1998 to 2015; b) identify the factors associated with the unemployment of graduates; c) determine employer feedback on the performance of its

graduates; d) assess the satisfaction level of graduates regarding the program offerings, and educational training and competencies received from the BSU-Buguias campus.

The Benguet State University-Buguias Campus

The humble beginning of the institution can be traced since January 23, 1932, as Loo Settlement Farm School then became the Loo National Vocational High School by Republic Act 3436 on June 18, 1961. Republic Act 3397 was created to establish a national trade school in the municipality of Buguias. On May 4, 1965, the two Republic Acts 3436 and 3397 were merged through Republic Act 4192, which gave birth to the Buguias-Loo Agro-Industrial School (BLAIS) then converted to Buguias-Loo Polytechnic College on December 30, 1994, through Republic Act 7894. Finally, Buguias Loo Polytechnic College was integrated into Benguet State University on May 24, 2001, by virtue of Republic Act 8292.

The Benguet State University-Buguias Campus offered Bachelor of Science in Industrial Education in 1994, followed by Bachelor of Science in Agricultural Education and Bachelor of Agricultural Technology in 1995. The school further offered a Bachelor of Secondary Education in 1998, then finally, Bachelor of Elementary Education in 2002. As of 2015, there were 83 graduates in Bachelor of Science in Industrial Education; 44 graduates in Bachelor of Science in Agricultural Education; 63 graduates in Bachelor of Agricultural Technology; 186 Bachelor of Secondary Education; and 122 graduates in Bachelor of Elementary Education.

The institution's offering of the aforementioned programs comes to its responsibility of addressing the challenges brought about by the 21st century, like the need of cultivating 21st-century skills, which includes cultivating 21st-century skills, including critical thinking, communication skills, creativity, problem-solving, perseverance, collaboration, information literacy, and technology skills and digital literacy. Executive order # 83 series of 2012 established the Philippine Qualifications Framework, which mandates the different agencies their responsibilities for quality assurance of their services. The Commission on Higher Education (CHED) was created with a vision to become the key leader of the Philippine higher education system to work effectively in partnership with the major higher education stakeholders in



building the country's human capital and innovation toward the development of a Filipino nation (Gines, 2014).

Furthermore, CHED is mandated to promote relevant, efficient, and quality higher education. The study of Siraye et al. (2018) found that employability skills are "those basic skills necessary for getting, keeping and doing well on a job" (Robinson & Garton, 2008). Further, it is also observed that employers require generic competencies such as teamwork, communication skills, or problem-solving skills, in combination with specific competencies acquired through experience or formal education that includes communication skills, interactional skills, computer skills, civilization skills, ethics, personal management, vocational mature, problem-solving skills, and career development skills (Gainer, 2002).

With the foregoing CHED mandate and results of conducted studies, it can be seen that today's challenging economic situation means that it is no longer sufficient for a new graduate to know an academic subject. Students must also gain skills that will enhance their prospects of employment. Hence, higher education institutions (HEI) have tended to serve as institutions for moral and intellectual development as well as centers of civilization.

HEI's prime task is to ensure that education and training are market-driven and responsive to the challenging needs of various sectors of the economy. Also, employers wanted to hire graduates with relevant subject-specific skills and knowledge, and understanding the hiring criteria for the Department of Education (DO_s2015_2015) includes education (20), teaching experience (15), LET/PBET rating (15), specialized training and skills (10), interview (10), demonstration teaching (15) and communication skills (15) as of 2015. In addition, the government, business owners, and policy-makers connect employability rates with the level of skills and competencies that Higher Education graduates have acquired (Frank & Meyer, 2007). The Philippine Professional Standards for Teachers (2017) also aimed to: set out clear expectations of teachers along well-defined career stages of professional development from beginning to distinguished practice; engage teachers to actively embrace a continuing effort in attaining proficiency and apply a uniform measure to assess teacher performance, identify needs, and provide support for professional development.

This study was conducted due to the following reasons: Benguet State University – Buguias Campus is a higher education institution and has its share in attaining the aforesaid CHED mandate; There was no study conducted regarding graduate employability since the offering of degree programs; a study on the employability of graduates was required by the Accrediting Agency of Chartered Colleges and Universities in the Philippines (AACUP) during the preliminary survey in 2019; lastly, the institution aims to contribute to the country's economic growth through the employment of its graduates.

Methodology

This study utilized descriptive quantitative research to determine the employment status and satisfaction level of Benguet State University-Buguias Campus graduates. Descriptive research is a study designed to depict the participants accurately. It is all about describing the people who take part in the study (Kowalczyk, 2016). A survey-based design was also employed to generate the needed data.

This study was conducted at Benguet State University, Loo, Buguias, Benguet. The population included all students who completed their degree programs from 1998 to 2015. However, only 236 out of 486 graduates responded, which is around 48.56%. This percentage falls within the expected response rate of 30-60% recommended by Schomburg (2003).

This paper used a developed questionnaire based on the Commission on Higher Education questionnaire for tracer studies. The questionnaire is divided into two parts: Part I is the education and employment that includes: A. Education (Bachelor's degree, Master's degree, and vocational); B. Employment which includes: Employment after graduation, Agency and address of employment, length of service, position/current job, employment status, reasons for pursuing the job, and; C. Factors associated to unemployment (enrolled in advanced studies, lack of professional eligibility, health-related issues, family concerns, end of contract, lack of work experience, no job opportunity). Part II is the employment performance of graduates from employers (knowledge to the job, work ethics,



values, and skillsets). Part III is the satisfaction level of the students on the education and training provided by BSU-BC that includes the following criteria: my educational training in BSU-Buguias Campus was helpful, the degree I have taken is related to my present/ previous job, my course curriculum provided me with the knowledge I need in my present/previous job, my course curriculum provided me with the skills I need in my present/previous job, the use of varied teaching methodologies of my professors made me competent in my jobs, and the extent to which competencies contributed to the skills development of graduates that includes: collaboration skills, creativity, critical thinking, and problem-solving skills, entrepreneurial skills, information, media, and technology skills, life and career skills, leadership, responsibility and organizing skills.

A separate questionnaire based on R.A. 6713 (Code conduct and ethical standards for public officials and employees), PD 807, and CSC MC No. 48 was developed for employers. The employer's questionnaire consists of the evaluation criteria for graduates: (a). job knowledge; (b) work ethics (productivity, work quality, work consistency, and attendance), c) values (enthusiasm, attitude, cooperation, initiative, work relations, creativity, punctuality, and dependability), and (d) communication skills (listening, clarity, openness, empathy) and technical skills.

The two aforementioned developed questionnaires were printed in hard copies and made available for distribution to graduates and employers. Furthermore, soft copies of the questionnaires were made available online using Google forms for graduates working in foreign countries.

Before the questionnaires were given to the respondents, the reliability of the questionnaire was considered. Using Cronbach Alpha, the questionnaire for the graduates had a 0.78 index which indicates the reliability of the questionnaire. Further, the computed Cronbach Alpha value for the employers' questionnaire was 0.80 index, indicating its reliability.

The printed were handed personally by the researchers to the nearby respondents. Other questionnaires were sent through peers and family members of the graduates and employers. Distant graduates and employers were reached through

their social media accounts and e-mail addresses. Others were reached through short message service (SMS) and phone calls. Finally, an informal follow-up interview was arranged with some graduates and employers to clarify their answers to the questionnaire.

The graduates and employers were given enough time to answer the questionnaires before retrieval. The e-copies of questionnaires sent online were retrieved through Facebook messenger and email. Moreover, informal interviews were arranged with some graduates and twenty (20) of the nearby employers to clarify their responses. Frequency count, rank, percentage, and mean were used in the analysis.

Results and Discussion

Graduate Employability

Employed Graduates

It is evident in Table 1 that 38.14% of the BSU-Buguias Campus graduates from 1998 to 2015 were employed. The majority of the employed graduates are working in public schools while others are employed in private schools. Employed graduates belong to the teaching force as Teacher I, Teacher II, and Teacher III in the Department of Education and private schools in Benguet and Manila. The graduates were employed for around 1 year to 17 years after graduation.

Some employed graduates said that they were lucky because there were positions vacated by teachers who retired, and there were natural vacancies when they applied. They related that they were first taken as a substitute or contractual then later got a permanent position. Other graduates started as Parents Teachers Association (PTA)-paid, school-paid, municipal school board-paid, provincial school board paid, and others were volunteer teachers for some time before they were employed. This result conforms with the findings of Aquino et al. (2016) that the graduates' present jobs were mostly professional in nature, were also their first job, and were relevant to their degree.

Underemployed Graduates

Around 50.84% of the graduates surveyed were



Table 1

Employment Status of BSU-Buguias Campus Graduates from 1998 to 2015 (n =236)

| Employment Status | Frequency | Percentage (%) |
|-------------------|-----------|----------------|
| Employed | 90 | 38.14 |
| Underemployed | 120 | 50.84 |
| Unemployed | 26 | 11.02 |
| Total | 236 | 100.00 |

underemployed. This result showed that more than half of the graduates were underemployed. Many of them were non-board passers, although others were board passers. Graduates who were non-board passers revealed that they failed during their first attempt to take the licensure examination and never had the courage to try it again. They resorted to applying to jobs that did not require eligibility. Others said they applied to readily available jobs after they graduated because they needed to augment family expenses. Furthermore, few graduates said they were already used to their job; thus, they opted not to transfer to a job related to their degree program.

Moreover, board passers who were underemployed disclosed that there were no hiring or vacancies when they applied. Others communicated that being a fresh graduate, they had no teaching experience and no seminar or training certificates and that the criteria for hiring Teacher I position of the DepEd include: teaching experience (15 points) and specialized training and skills (10 points). In this case, a fresh graduate definitely will be automatically outranked by other applicants who have had more years of experience and have attended more seminars or earned training certificates since a new applicant will get zero (0) over 25 points. With this event, some graduates decided to apply to any available job rather than just waiting for a teaching opportunity making them underemployed.

Having the opportunities to work in another field other than teaching, many of the underemployed graduates took the chance to work as entrepreneurs, police officers, insurance agents, agricultural/farm technicians, military/army, barangay health workers, barangay kagawad, LGU staff, Christian

minister, loan officer of private lending agencies, SSS staff, overseas Filipino workers, and farmers.

Unemployed Graduates

The unemployment rate was 11.02%. The unemployed graduates were mostly females who got married early and took care of the family, having no opportunity and time to seek employment. During the interview one graduate said "*Nakiasawaak ay nasapa isunga nan awir ak et adak nan anap si obla*" (I married early and took care of my child so I did not apply for work). Also, a graduate said she got married even before completing her degree, so after graduation, she decided to bear a child. Other graduates also disclosed that they took care of a sick family member and had not tried to look for work. The foregoing results mirrored that some if not majority of Filipinos prioritize their familial obligations which conform to Golaya (2019), who found that Filipinos are known for having strong and close family ties such that they place high regard and put importance on their family before anything else. Finally, during the survey period, few graduates were unemployed because they opted to continue with their advanced studies.

Factors Associated with the Unemployment of Graduates

Table 2 presents the factors associated with the unemployment of graduates. Most unemployed graduates said that they prioritized their family over employment; thus, family concerns ranked first. The end of the contract followed to be the second rank. Some of the graduates disclosed that they were unemployed during the time of study due to either end of contract or rearing of children. This result agreed with the findings of Payne (1989) when he found that fathering to one's child raises the chance for unemployment. It was also found in the research of Cohut (2017) that men tend to engage in more leisure activities than women, especially on days off after the birth of their first child. Conversely, mothers are more focused on their child-rearing and household duties. Mckoy (2021) also mentioned that past researches showed that women tend to take on more responsibilities for doing housework and taking care of children, which may cause unemployment.

Lack of professional eligibility and lack of work



Table 2

Factors Associated with the Unemployment of BSU-Buguias Campus Graduates

| Factors | Frequency (n=26) | Rank |
|-------------------------------------|---------------------|------|
| 1. Enrolled in advanced studies | 2 | 5.0 |
| 2. Lack of professional eligibility | 3 | 3.5 |
| 3. Family concerns | 14 | 1.0 |
| 4. End of contract | 4 | 2.0 |
| 5. Lack of work experience | 3 | 3.5 |

experience both ranked 3.5. Graduates explained that though they were able to pass the LET, they still need to pass through the screening process of the Department of Education. They disclosed that they had low scores during the ranking due to having no teaching experience and fewer seminars and trainings attended. Graduates further shared that they do not have access to any seminars and trainings after graduation. Enrollment in advanced studies is also one reason why graduates were unemployed at the time of the study. The graduates said they are currently enrolled in advanced studies and planned to finish it first before applying for work hoping that after finishing graduate studies will give them an edge over the other applicants.

Performance Assessment from Employers

The employers' feedback on the performance of the graduates is a very important information for the school as this data will determine the relevance and responsiveness of the curriculum, programs, and services that the institution offers. Table 3 revealed that employers are very highly satisfied with the job knowledge of the graduates as shown by the weighted mean of 4.78. An employer during an interview commented that the graduates are efficient and effective in executing their lessons during a classroom observation. In addition, employers disclosed that students handled by the BSU-BC graduates were able to participate in the school and district activities like the nutrition month, *buwan ng wika*, science-math festival, indigenous people's month, and other related activities. These feedbacks from employers showed that the knowledge of the graduates were cascaded to their students.

Table 3

Performance Assessment of BSU-Buguias Campus Student by Employers (n=20)

| Criteria | Mean | Descriptive Equivalent |
|----------------------|------|------------------------|
| Knowledge to the job | 4.78 | VHS |
| Work Ethics | 4.65 | VHS |
| Values | 4.63 | VHS |
| Skill sets | 4.59 | VHS |

Legend:

| | |
|---------------|------------------------------|
| Weighted mean | Descriptive equivalent |
| 1.00-1.50 | Very Low Satisfaction (VLS) |
| 1.51-2.50 | Low Satisfaction (LS) |
| 2.51-3.50 | Moderate Satisfaction (MS) |
| 3.51-4.50 | High Satisfaction (HS) |
| 4.51-5.00 | Very High Satisfaction (VHS) |

Concerning the work ethics of graduates, a principal said during an interview that graduates of BSU-BC were willing to accept suggestions, criticisms, and recommendations. Another employer disclosed that BSU-BC graduates do their duties with utmost responsibility and competence. Similarly, some interviewed employers described some of the graduates to be upholding the interest of the school over personal interest. These results conformed with the findings of Aliu and Aigbavboa (2020) when he affirmed graduates' willingness to learn and achieve tasks with positive results. Finally, a common observation of employers to graduates was their punctuality in attending their classes.

Employers agree that the graduates from BSU-BC inculcated moral and spiritual values into their lessons as seen during classroom observations where graduates started their lessons with a short prayer.

Regarding skill sets, most of the principals interviewed detailed that the graduates are "jack of all trades" in their own simple ways for they can do basic flower arrangement, table decor, painting, baking, and can do simple letterings for school occasions. These skills of graduates maybe because of the student's exposure to practicing the above-mentioned skills during programs and events hosted by the school. In addition, male graduates assist in carpentry works like repairing tables and chairs.



In reference to communication skills, a principal suggested that the verbal and written skills of graduates be developed as some graduates cannot express their messages fully. Indeed, one school head said, “The mother tongue (Kankana-ey) is being misused by some graduates”. Nevertheless, some employers noticed that some graduates could communicate well in Filipino. With this result, there is indeed a need to enhance the oral and communication skills of BSU-BC graduates. In agreement with the comment above, another employer said, “*Mayat nagaget da ngem no mamingsan yan adi dan ammo ay makikali si kosto*” (It’s good they are industrious but sometimes they do not know how to communicate well).

Moreover, some employers observed that the graduates also lack research skills as none of the graduates disclosed of completing a research study related to their field of specialization except their undergraduate thesis.

Level of Satisfaction of Graduates on the Education and Training Provided by the BSU-BC

Table 4a shows the level of satisfaction of graduates on the education and training provided by the BSU-BC that includes the following criteria: my education and training in BSU-BC was helpful with a mean of 3.48 interpreted as having a very high satisfaction; the criteria on whether the degree is related to their present job had a mean of 3.59 interpreted as having a very high satisfaction; the criteria on “program curriculum provided the knowledge needed to the present/previous job”

had a mean of 3.52 also interpreted as having a very high satisfaction; the curriculum provided the skills needed in the present/previous job had a mean of 3.49 also interpreted as having a very high satisfaction; and use of varied teaching methodologies of my professors made the graduate competent on the job had a mean of 3.38 interpreted as having a very high satisfaction.

Students stressed that their education at BSU-BC was helpful. Finishing their degree qualified them to take eligibility/board exams which later was used in applying for a job. Graduates disclosed that their degree was related to their present job since many of them were employed in public and private schools. This result of the study is aligned with the findings of Robst (2007) regarding the match between education and jobs based on the relationship between college majors and work activities. He found that about 20% of workers reported that their work was not related to their degree or field as majority of the workers had their jobs related to their degree. The result showed that the quantity of schooling is the only way to consider the match between schooling and jobs.

The graduates are very highly satisfied that the program curriculum provided them with the knowledge they needed in their present/previous job. Majority of graduates who were interviewed mentioned that the curriculum provided them with the knowledge they needed to teach. For the unemployed graduates, they still believe that the institution provided them with the necessary information they need as they tried to look for a

Table 4a

Level of Satisfaction of Graduates on the Education and Training Provided by BSU-Buguias Campus

| Criteria | Mean | Descriptive Equivalent |
|--|-------------|-------------------------------|
| 1. My educational training in BSU-Buguias Campus was helpful | 3.48 | Very High Satisfaction |
| 2. The degree I have taken is related to my present/ previous job | 3.59 | Very High Satisfaction |
| 3. My course curriculum provided me with the knowledge I need in my present/previous job | 3.52 | Very High Satisfaction |
| 4. My program curriculum provided me with the skills I need in my present/previous job | 3.49 | Very High Satisfaction |
| 5. The use of varied teaching methodologies of my professors made me competent in my jobs. | 3.38 | Very High Satisfaction |
| Grand Mean | 3.49 | Very High Satisfaction |

| Legend: | Scale | Descriptive equivalent | Scale | Descriptive equivalent |
|---------|-----------|----------------------------|-----------|------------------------------|
| | 1.00-1.75 | Low Satisfaction (LS) | 2.51-3.25 | High Satisfaction (HS) |
| | 1.76-2.50 | Moderate Satisfaction (MS) | 3.26-4.00 | Very High Satisfaction (VHS) |



job other than teaching. Some graduates further disclosed that they were able to pass the qualification standards set by the Department of Education in the ranking for teacher 1 applicants. Though some graduates pass the qualification standards, some were dismayed by the ranking criteria set by the DepEd. Some of them commented, “*No fresh graduate ka meju narigat di maipermanente tan magay experience mo ya maga di certificates mo si trainings ya seminars/conferences ay panpuntosam* (If you are a fresh graduate, getting a permanent status is hard because you do not have teaching experience and no certificate of trainings/seminars/conferences to earn points). With these sentiments, the BSU-BC management needs to widen its linkages to help its graduates avail of seminar and training opportunities to make them at par with other applicants.

The criteria on the program curriculum provided the knowledge that I needed in my present/previous job was interpreted as having a very high satisfaction. Graduates believed that the knowledge they accumulated from their years of stay on the campus provided them with the knowledge needed to educate their students. Kurtus (2022) stated that being knowledgeable is the first step in becoming skilled and confident. This means you are knowledgeable if you will master remembering and understanding the things you learn and knowing how to use it in various related tasks. Nevertheless, majority of the employed and unemployed graduates said they were very satisfied with the knowledge learned from BSU-BC as this is now used in their present/previous work.

The BSU-BC graduates are very highly satisfied that they were provided with the necessary skills they need in their present/previous job. The graduates’ believed that important strategies and art of teaching were learned from the institution as one of the graduates commented “*laydek din panag itdon di teachers isunga idi nan isuro ak et say inyat ko abe* (I like the teaching strategies of teachers that is why when I taught, I adapted their teaching strategy). Though graduates are very highly satisfied with the learned skill, it was suggested by some employers that the communication skills of graduates need to be improved as Khan (2017) found that teacher’s communication skills have a significant role in the academic achievement of their students.

The fifth criterion on the use of varied teaching

methodologies of the instructors made me competent in my jobs was also described as having a very high satisfaction. Though this criterion was perceived to have very high satisfaction, some graduates recommended the use of educational tools such as Google Classroom, Edmodo, and other online educational tools to augment strategies used by teachers.

Table 4b shows the level of satisfaction to which the skill competencies contributed to their development as graduates. The criteria on collaboration skills (effectively verbalizes and writes English ideas, is a team player, possesses networking, linking, and human relation skills, interacts effectively with others) had the highest mean of 3.40 described to be with very high satisfaction. Leadership, responsibility, and organizing skills (ability to influence people) and productivity and accountability skills (set and meet goals; work positively and ethically; multi-task; manage time and projects effectively) both had a mean of 3.34 described as having a very high satisfaction.

Furthermore, the criteria on creativity, critical thinking and problem-solving skills (reasons effectively; uses system thinking, makes a sound decision and judgments in problem-solving) had a mean of 3.33 described as having a very high satisfaction; entrepreneurial skills (ability to understand and do business) had a mean of 3.26 with high satisfaction descriptive rating; life and career skills (flexibility, adaptability, initiative, and self-direction) had a mean of 3.25 described to have a high satisfaction rating and finally, information, media, and technology skills (proficiency and ability to analyze and apply technology effectively) had a mean of 3.23 with a high satisfaction descriptive rating.

In regards to collaboration skills, graduates believed that they have good human relations and could work with colleagues in the workplace. Some graduates narrated that none of them encountered any misunderstanding with a colleague or a supervisor. Kissflow (2020) detailed that collaboration is the foundation of all work processes and essential to overall work success. It also brings teams together to achieve common goals and focus on individual responsibilities. Further, collaboration helps drive growth and innovation. With this, it is assumed that the BSU-Buguias Campus has done its



part in instilling collaboration skills in terms of working with a team and maintaining good human relationship in and out of the workplace. Though collaboration skill was described as such, it cannot be entirely concluded that the graduates are very highly satisfied with their collaboration skills as Custom Insight (2022) defined employee satisfaction to be the extent to which employees are happy or contented with their jobs and work environment. whereas, a happy or contented employee might be quite satisfied with a job that requires very little effort or might be perfectly contented doing the bare minimum requirement to keep his or her job. Similarly, one of the limitations of measuring client satisfaction is that the expected versus the delivered value of services offered is not holistically reflected. This means that the result of the satisfaction survey to BSU-BC students does not necessarily measure the overall value or quality of the school and its offerings.

The BSU-BC graduates are very highly satisfied with the productivity and accountability skills learned because they were able to meet the deadlines set for the submission of reports and they were able to maintain a healthy relationship with peers and clients. Correspondingly, the

graduates considered themselves as productive in their own way as shown by their high ratings during classroom observations of school administrators and as reflected in the passing grades of their students. Likewise, they were able to do multi-tasking at times by serving as a guidance counselor, coach, facilitator, coordinator of events, master of ceremonies, cook, and other non-teaching related functions that they may be required to do.

Additionally, the graduates had a very high satisfaction rating on creativity, critical thinking and problem-solving skills because some of the unemployed graduates were creative in a way that they were able to work in allied professional jobs like entrepreneurs, police officers, and insurance agents, agricultural farm technicians, military personnel, barangay health workers, barangay kagawad, government personnel, spiritual advocates, loan officers, overseas Filipino workers, and farmers. This scenario shows the critical thinking and problem-solving skills of graduates because they were able to find ways to have a job and earn a living. Rad (2014) said that those good problem solvers are good thinkers, they have less drama and problems to begin with, and do not get overly emotional when faced with a problem. They

Table 4b

Level of Satisfaction of Graduates on the Skills Training Provided by BSU-Buguias Campus

| Competency Criteria | Mean | Descriptive Equivalent |
|--|-------------|-------------------------------|
| 1. Collaboration skills (Effectively verbalizes and writes English ideas, team player, networking, linkaging, and human relation skills, interact effectively with others) | 3.40 | Very High Satisfaction |
| 2. Productivity and accountability skills (Set and meet goals; work positively and ethically, multi-task, manage time and projects effectively) | 3.34 | Very High Satisfaction |
| 3. Leadership, responsibility, and organizing skills (Ability to influence people) | 3.34 | Very High Satisfaction |
| 4. Creativity, critical thinking, and problem-solving skills (Reasons effectively; use system thinking, make sound decisions and judgments in problem-solving) | 3.33 | Very High Satisfaction |
| 5. Entrepreneurial skills (Ability to understand and do business) | 3.26 | Very High Satisfaction |
| 6. Life and career skills (Flexibility, adaptability, initiative, and self-direction) | 3.25 | High Satisfaction |
| 7. Information, media, and technology skills (Proficiency and ability to analyze and apply technology effectively) | 3.23 | High Satisfaction |
| Grand Mean | 3.31 | Very High Satisfaction |

| | | | | |
|----------------|--------------|-------------------------------|--------------|-------------------------------|
| <i>Legend:</i> | <i>Scale</i> | <i>Descriptive equivalent</i> | <i>Scale</i> | <i>Descriptive equivalent</i> |
| | 1.00-1.75 | Low Satisfaction (LS) | 2.51-3.25 | High Satisfaction (HS) |
| | 1.76-2.50 | Moderate Satisfaction (MS) | 3.26-4.00 | Very High Satisfaction (VHS) |



usually see problems as challenges and life experiences and try to stand above them, objectively. This statement of Rad was also reflected to the employed graduates when they narrated that they were happy because they were able to appropriately solve the problems they met in their teaching.

The graduates were also highly satisfied with the entrepreneurial skills, life and career skills, and information media and technology skills learned from the school. During the informal interviews, some of the earlier graduates said that their entrepreneurial skills were enhanced through the years but it began during their stay in the institution. Some activities done by the graduates during their education on the campus were: cooking chayote candy, potato candy, 'pulvoron', 'turon', baking, and painting. Also, some graduates can be tapped to do painting and baking jobs at a reasonable price. Recent graduates said that their information, media, and technology skills started during their stay in BSU-BC. They further commented that their instructors for the Basic computer education were approachable and helpful, thus encouraging them to learn the new technologies brought about by the changing times.

Lastly, some graduates disclosed that only when they were hired to teach that they were able to comprehend what teaching is all about.

Conclusions

Since many of the graduates are underemployed, there is a need to go over the BSU-Buguias campus program offerings and align them to the work demand needed by the industry. Lack of professional eligibility is one factor that affects the unemployment of graduates. Nevertheless, underboard graduates may opt to apply for the training, assessment, and certification offered by Technical Education and Skills Development Authority (TESDA) to further improve their skills. Despite the positive reactions of employers to the graduates, there is still a need to enhance the curriculum. Competencies on skills related to the student's program must be added to the curriculum as it is included in the hiring criteria of the Department of Education. Also, research capabilities among graduates and the use

of technology in teaching must be practiced as these skills are now solving many workplace issues.

Moreover, though findings showed that the graduates are highly satisfied with their educational training received from campus, it is still a must that program competencies be reviewed to align them to the changing demands of the labor force.

Recommendations

The Benguet State University-Buguias Campus needs to do a curriculum review on the institution's program offerings since the study showed that many of the graduates were underemployed and unemployed. Further, a study on the performance of graduates in their professional examinations will serve as a basis for curriculum review and possible interventions. The institution needs to conduct in-house reviews to graduates to help them pass the licensure examination for them to be employed. It is further recommended that competencies on skills be added to the curriculum as this criterion was added to hiring new teachers by the Department of Education. In addition, an in-depth study on student satisfaction to the program offerings of Benguet State University-Buguias Campus needs to be conducted regularly since this study is from 1998-2015 only. The institution shall procure more ICT facilities and subscribe to a consistent internet connection as internet connectivity is a must for the success of any institution.

References

- Aftab, J., & Sarwar, H., Sultan, Q.U.A., & Qadeer, M. (2016). Importance of Service Quality in Customer Satisfaction (A Study on Fast Food Restaurants). *Entrepreneurship and Innovation Management Journal*, 4(4), 161-171. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/313192868_Importance_of_Service_Quality_in_Customer_Satisfaction_A_Study_on_Fast_Food_Restaurants
- Alhasan, I., Nalarb, R., & Yakubu, B. (2018). Analysis of Graduate Satisfaction and Experience with Higher Education Services in a Ghanaian



- University. *European Journal of Educational Sciences*, 5(4), 14-27. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1235999.pdf>
- Aliu, J., & Aigbavboa, C.O. (2020). Employers' perception of employability skills among built-environment graduates. *Journal of Engineering, Design and Technology*, 18(4), 847-864. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JEDT-06-2019-0162>
- Aquino, A.B., Punongbayan, E.J., Macalaguim, L.P., Bauyon, S.M., Rodriguez Jr, R.A., & Quizon, G.R. (2016). Teacher education graduate tracer study from 2010 to 2014 in one state university in Batangas, Philippines. *Asia Pacific Journal of Multidisciplinary Research*, 3(5), 45-50.
- Cohut, M. (2017). Women 'spend more time on housework, childcare than men'. *Medical News Today*. <https://www.medicalnewstoday.com/articles/319687>
- Custom Insight. (2022). What is Employee Satisfaction? Defining and Measuring Satisfaction. <https://www.custominsight.com/employee-engagement-survey/what-is-employee-satisfaction.asp>
- Frank, D., & Meyer, J. (2007). University Expansion and the Knowledge Society. *Theory and Society*, 36(4), 287-311. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/227088204_University_expansion_and_the_knowledge_society
- Gainer, L. (2002). ASTD Update: Basic skills. American Society for Training and Development Alexandria, VA. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/330365596_A_tracer_study_on_employability_of_business_and_economics_graduates_at_Bahir_Dar_University
- Gallemard, J. (2020). Why – and how – should customer satisfaction be measured? *Smart Tribune*. <https://blog.smart-tribune.com/en/why-how-should-customer-satisfaction-be-measured>
- Gines, A. (2014). Tracer Study of PNU Graduates. *American International Journal of Contemporary Research*, 4(3), 81-98. https://www.aijcrnet.com/journals/Vol_4_No_3_March_2014/10.pdf
- Golaya, J.E. (2019). *Traditional Filipino Family Values that make us Distinct among Others*. <https://medium.com/@janeellapangoyala/traditional-filipino-family-values-that-make-us-distinct-among-others-7a439fd28a>
- Kahsay, M.N. (2012). *Quality and Quality Assurance in Ethiopian Higher Education: Critical Issues and Practical Implications*. Center for Higher Education Policy Studies (CHEPS). <https://doi.org/10.3990/1.9789036533157>
- Kempster, H. (2021). What is employability and why is it important. *Future Learn*. <https://www.futurelearn.com/info/courses/career-success/0/steps/21285>.
- Kenton, W. (2020). Corporate Finance & Accounting Financial Analysis. <https://gcwgandhinagar.com/econtent/document/1589187524Unit%203,%20cost%20accounting,%20%20sem%204.pdf>
- Khan, A., Khan, S., Zia-Ul-Islam, S., & Khan, M. (2017). Communication Skills of a Teacher and Its Role in the Development of the Students' Academic Success. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 8(1), 18-21. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1131770.pdf>
- Kissflow. (2020). The Importance of Collaboration in the Workplace. <https://kissflow.com/digital-workplace/collaboration/importance-of-collaboration-in-the-workplace/>
- Kowalczyk, D. (2016). Research methodologies: Quantitative, qualitative, and mixed methods. *Study.com*. <http://study.com/academy/lesson/research-methodologies-quantitative-qualitative-mixed-method.html>
- Kurtus, R. (2022). Succeed by Being Knowledgeable. *School for Champions*. <https://www.school-for-champions.com/knowledge.htm#.Ym2x4OdByUk>
- Mckoy, J. (2021). Lack of Child Care Associated with Higher Unemployment among Women Compared to Men. *School of Public Health*. <https://www.bu.edu/sph/news/articles/2021/lack-of-child-care-associated-with-higher-unemployment-among-women-compared-to-men/>
- Malik, M.E., Nawab, S., Naeem, B., & Danish, R.Q. (2010). Job satisfaction and organizational commitment of university teachers in public sector of Pakistan. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 5(6), 17-26. <https://>



- www.researchgate.net/publication/43968940_Job_Satisfaction_and_Organizational_Commitment_of_University_Teachers_in_Public_Sector_of_Pakistan
- Payne, J. (1989). Unemployment and Family Formation Among Young Men *Sociology*, 23(2), 171-191. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038589023002002>
- Picardo, E. (2020). How the Unemployment Rate Affects Everybody. *Investopedia*. <https://www.investopedia.com/articles/economics/10/unemployment-rate-get-real.asp>
- Rad, M.R. (2014). 10 Characteristics of Good Problem Solvers. *Huffpost*. https://www.huffpost.com/entry/problem-solving_b_4302935
- Rada, J. (2019). PH unemployment rate down to 5.2% in January. *Manila Standard*. <https://manilastandard.net/business/biz-plus/289485/ph-unemployment-rate-down-to-5-2-in-january.html>
- Robinson, J.S., & Garton, B. (2008). An Assessment of the Employability Skills Needed by College of Agriculture, Food and Natural Resources Graduates at the University of Missouri-Columbia. *Journal of Agricultural Education*, 34(4), 96-105. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5032/jae.2008.04096>
- Robst, J. (2007). Education and job match: The relatedness of college major and work. *Economics of Education Review*, 26, 397-407. <https://www.collegetransitions.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/05/robst-relatedness-of-college-major-and-work.pdf>
- Ramya, N., Kowsalya, A., & Dharanipriya, K. (2019). Service quality and its dimensions. *EPRA International Journal of Research & Development*, 4, 38-41. <https://www.researchgate.net/publication>
- Schomburg, H. (2003). *Handbook for Tracer Study*. Kassel: Center for Research on Higher Education and Work, University of Kassel.
- Siraye, Z., Abebe, T., Melese, M., & Wale, T. (2018). A tracer study on employability of business and economics graduates at Bahir Dar University. *International Journal of Higher Education and Sustainability*, 2(1), 45-63. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/330365596_A_tracer_study_on_employability_of_business_and_economics_graduates_at_Bahir_Dar_University
- United Nation Statistics Division. (2020). *Promote sustained, inclusive and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment and decent work for all*. <https://unstats.un.org/sdgs/report/2021/goal-08/>

